

Online appendix for “Is liberal society a parasite on tradition?”

Samuel Bowles

Philosophy and Public Affairs, Winter, 2011

Texts

Smith (1776)

The division of labor is limited by the extent of the market.

In the progress of the division of labor, the employment of the far greater part of those who live by labor, that is, of the great body of the people, comes to be confined to a few very simple operations, frequently to one or two. But the understandings of the greater part of men are necessarily formed by their ordinary employments. The man whose whole life is spent in performing a few simple operations, of which the effects are perhaps always the same, or very nearly the same, has no occasion to exert his understanding or to exercise his invention in finding out expedients for removing difficulties which never occur. He naturally loses, therefore, the habit of such exertion, and generally becomes as stupid and ignorant as it is possible for a human creature to become. The torpor of his mind renders him not only incapable of relishing or bearing a part in any rational conversation, but of conceiving any generous, noble, or tender sentiment, and consequently of forming any just judgment concerning many even of the ordinary duties of private life. Of the great and extensive interests of his country he is altogether incapable of judging. (Smith (1937), *Wealth...*) Book Five, Chapter I, Part 3, Article II.

Burke (1790, 1791)

Men are qualified for civil liberty, in exact proportion to their disposition to put moral chains upon their appetites, in proportion as their love of justice is above their rapacity; in proportion as their soundness and sobriety is above their vanity and presumption..” (Burke (1791):64, *Letter...*)

When I see the spirit of liberty in action, I see a strong principle at work; ... I should therefore suspend my congratulations on the new liberty of France, until I was informed how it had been combined with government; with public force; with the discipline and obedience of armies; with the collection of an effective and well-distributed revenue; with the solidity for property; with peace in order; with civil and social manners... without

them, liberty is not a benefit while it lasts, and is not likely to continue long. ...the age of chivalry is gone. That of Sophisters, economists, and calculators has succeeded ...Nothing is left which engages the affection on the part of the commonwealth...so as to create in us love, veneration, admiration or attachment.(Burke (1890[1790]): 84-86 *Reflections...*)

Tocqueville (1834, 1840)

...religion has been entangled with those institutions which democracy destroys...Liberty cannot be established without morality, nor morality without faith. ... No free communities ever existed without morals. (Tocqueville (1945):I,12;II 208, *Democracy...*)

A democratic state of society, similar to that of the Americans, might offer singular facilities for the establishment of despotism; ...an innumerable multitude of men, all equal and alike, incessantly endeavoring to procure the petty and paltry pleasures with which they glut their lives Each of them, living apart, is a stranger to the fate of all the rest...his children and his private friends constitute to him the whole of mankind; as for the rest of his fellow citizens, he is close to them but he sees them not...he touches them but he feels them not; he exists but in himself and for himself alone...Above this race of men stands an immense and tutelary power, which takes upon itself alone to secure their gratifications and to watch over their fate. ...what remains, but to spare them all the care of thinking and all the trouble of living? Such a power does not tyrannize, but compresses, enervates, extinguishes and stupefies a people, till each nation is reduced to nothing better than a flock of timid and industrious animals, of which the government is the shepherd. ... servitude of the regular, quite and gentle kind I have just described might be combined more easily than is commonly believed with some of the outward forms of freedom.(II, 334-337) .

...the manufacturing aristocracy which is growing up under our eyes is one of the harshest that ever existed in the world. (II,170-71.

... it is difficult indeed to conceive how men who have entirely given up the habit of self government should succeed in making a proper choice of those by whom they are to be governed; and no one will ever believe that a liberal, wise and energetic government can spring from the suffrages of a subservient people. (II, 339.

Marx and Engels (1847-8)

Finally there came a time when everything that men had considered as inalienable became an object of exchange, of traffic and could be alienated. This is the time when the very things which till then had been communicated, but never exchanged, given but never sold, acquired but never bought: virtue, love, conviction, knowledge, conscience– when everything passed into commerce. It is the time of general corruption of universal

venality. Marx Marx (1956):32 (*Poverty..*)

The bourgeoisie, wherever it has got the upper hand, has put an end to all feudal, patriarchal, idyllic relations ...and left no other nexus between man and man than naked self-interest than callous “cash payment.” It has drowned the most heavenly ecstasies of religious fervor...in the icy waters of egotistical calculation. Marx and Engels Marx and Engels (1972) (*...Manifesto*)

Polanyi (1944)

Our thesis is that the idea of a self-adjusting market implied a stark utopia. Such an institution could not exist for any length of time without annihilating the human and natural substance of society p. 3 ... [The] market for labor implied no less than the wholesale destruction of the traditional fabric of society p. 77 Social history in the 19th century was thus the result of a double movement: the extension of the market organization in respect to genuine commodities was accompanied by its restriction in respect to the fictitious ones. p. 76. [T]he labor market was allowed to retain its main function only on... conditions] that ...would safeguard the human character of the alleged commodity, labor. p. 177 Polanyi (1957) (*...Transformation*)

Bell (1973, 1976)

The historic justifications of bourgeois society -- in the realms of religion and character -- are gone.. ... The lack of a rooted moral belief system is the cultural contradiction of the society ... (Bell (1973)48, *...Post-industrial society*)

.the problem of virtue arose because of the dual and necessarily contradictory role of the individual as *citoyen* and *bourgeois*. As the first, he had the obligation to the polity of which he was a part; as the second he had private concerns which he pursued for his own self-interest. (Bell (1976)21, *Cultural contradictions of capitalism*)

In historical retrospect, bourgeois society had a double source and a double fate. The one current was a Puritan, Whig capitalism in which the emphasis was not just on economic activity but on the formation of character (sobriety, probity, work as a calling). The other was a secular Hobbesiansm, a radical individualism which saw man as unlimited in his appetite, which was restrained in politics by a sovereign but ran fully free in economics an culture. (Bell (1976):80)

American capitalism...has lost its traditional legitimacy, which was based on a moral system or reward rooted in the Protestant sanctification of work. (Bell (1976):84)

The major consequence of this crisis .. is the loss of *civitas*, that spontaneous willingness

to obey the law, to respect the rights of others, to forgo the temptations of private enrichment at the expense of the public weal (Bell (1976):245)

Habermas (1975)

The “Protestant ethic” with its emphasis on self-discipline, secularized vocational ethos, and renunciation of immediate gratification, is no less based on tradition than its traditionalist counterpart of uncoerced obedience, fatalism and orientation to immediate gratification. These traditions cannot be renewed on the basis of bourgeois society alone.

Bourgeois culture as a whole was never able to reproduce itself from itself. It was always dependent on motivationally effective supplementation by traditional world-views. 77

...the remains of pre-bourgeois traditions, in which civil and familial-vocational privatism are embedded, are being non-renewably dismantled ..[they are] softened and increasingly dissolved in the course of capitalist development. (Habermas (1975):79, *Legitimation..*)

Hirsch (1976)

This legacy [of pre-capitalist moral codes] has diminished with time and with the corrosive contact of the active capitalist values. As individual behavior has been increasingly directed to individual advantage, habits and instincts based on communal attitudes and objectives have lost out (Hirsch (1976):117-18, *Social limits..*)

Works cited

Bell, Daniel. 1973. *The Coming of Post-Industrial Society: A Venture in Social Forecasting*. New York: Basic Books, Inc.

Bell, Daniel. 1976. *The cultural contradictions of capitalism*. New York: Basic Books.

Burke, Edmund. 1791. *A letter from Mr. Burke to a member of the Nationl Assembly in answer to some objections to his Book on French Affairs*. London: Dodsley, Pall-Mall.

Burke, Edmund. 1890[1790]. *Reflections on the Revolution in France*. New York: Macmillian.

Habermas, Jurgen. 1975. *Legitimation Crisis*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Hirsch, Fred. 1976. *Social Limits to Growth*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Marx, Karl. 1956. *The poverty of philosophy*. Moscow: Foreign Language Publishing House.

Marx, Karl and Friedrich Engels. 1972. "The Communist Manifesto," in *The Marx-Engels Reader, 2nd Edition*. Robert Tucker ed. New York: W. W. Norton & Company (first published in 1848).

Polanyi, Karl. 1957. *The Great Transformation: the Political and Economic Origins of our Time*. Beacon Hill: Beacon Press.

Smith, Adam. 1937. *The Wealth of Nations*. New York: Modern Library (originally published in 1776).

Tocqueville, Alexis de. 1945. *Democracy in America*. Vintage.